## SUPERINTENDENT WHIPPLE MAKES REPLY TO CHARGES MADE BY AUDITOR CALLAGHAN

Superintendent Whipple Challenges Findings Made by Auditor Callag-han as Result of Moral Conditions Alleged to Have Existed.

Says Public Testimony Does Not Up-hold Charges and Tells of Trying Experiences Upon Removal of Institution From Benson to Ft. Grant.

In response to a request from Governor Hunt for an answer to the charges made by Auditor Callaghan. in detail. Dealing with the conditions alleged to have existed at the institution, the Era takes the followng from the reply of the Superin-

Morals.

Of 269 typewritten pages comprising a transcript of the testimony secured at Mr. Callaghan's investigation. This falsehood is merely another, and tion, no less than 130-or about onehalf of the total record—have to do tion of the testimony, which finds its with the morals at the State Indus-only basis in the fact that after the trial School. Clearly, therefore, this matron and the man who afterward is a subject dear to the Auditor's heart, became her husband had been disfor which he muse be highly commend ed, and it would be both impertinent and misplaced, here or at this time, to question his qualifications for grasping it scientifically, if not sympathetically, and weighing the evidence with judicial accuracy, even though somewhat lacking in the attributes of common, humane charity.

I must, however, express the most poignant regret that Mr. Callaghan considered it necessary to fill more than seventy pages of his transcriptmismanagement.

tance admits that "the evidence further comments as to lead inevitable to the conclusion that the lady's "trans were of the most serious character. It is not my purpose to tution, but I must in common fair-ness to both her and the school assert that Mr. Callaghan's insinuations are unwarranted by the evidence; and his deductions, as they affect school and the management thereof, are absolutely immaterial.

taking into account that I know them suit of information regarding all and have a means of estimating morals of the Industrial School, material upon which to lay this seem- State Industrial School. ing corner-stone of Mr. Callaghan's attack, and there is much, in truth, examination, which was not in that is discreditable, but when honestly sifted, analyzed and weighed, delicate if not boorish language.

view is concurred in by Mrs.

serve the matron in question for some time prior to her departure, and com- too much to the honor of the inmates petent to judge.

On my own behalf I will say that the Gov- is wholly false, as the transcript of in behalf of the injured girls under the evidence—even in the case of those her professional care, while the use charges made by Auditor Callaghan witnesses who were selected by Mr. to which I would put the confidence against the State Industrial School, Callaghan for reasons other than their and reliance of which he complains is W. M. Whipple, Superintendent of friendliness to myself—will bear out. that of encouraging, elevating and rethat institution, has submitted to the State Board of Conrtol, his reply conpicable, is the unblushing statement—picable, is the unblushing statement—and wayward youth. sisting of approximately forty type following the Auditor's conviction of Suffice it is to say that the unwel-work for the moment and lined up written pages, in which the superin-the matron of having a paramour, an employe whom she has since married Mr. Callaghan's investigation for the to an examination under the Registration of the control of the cedure toward allowing them to an unusually contemptible discoloracharged she told me that they were going to be married and made application to be permitted to remain, which request was of course denied. The resignation of Prof. Gung'l, which he withdrew, was due to a misunder- if not irrelevant, character. A care- will continue from now until the mid-standing, as he has already and will ful analytical reading of the report die of August when the register will readily confirm.

In his report Mr. Callaghan dwells in characteristic vein upon a tolerably recent occurrence. Highly sensationalized accounts of this incident-giv fifty per cent of that large portion having to do with the subject of morals—with testimony, and much of doubtful accuracy, regarding the conditions alleged to exist at the Industrial School—fairly saturated the columns of many of the choice family journals ing rise to still more sensational and duct of two ex-matrons, in neither of of Arizona at the time, and next to whom either the school, the Auditor the case of the matrons who were disor myself can have any possible con-cern, since both were long ago dis-ance of the Auditor's trial of the charged, and so far as I know are now engaged in the living of quiet, respectable, law-abiding lives in no wise distinguished by attempts to blacken the charged from their dormitory, through a ventilator in the floor, through a ventilator in the floor, the charged from their dormitory, through a ventilator in the floor, the charged from their dormitory, through a ventilator in the floor, the charged from their dormitory, through a ventilator in the floor, the charged from their dormitory through a ventilator in the floor. the character of others. It is even more deplorable that in his report he distorts, exaggerates, misinterprets where a number of boys, reported to and magnifies the evidence as zealously and persistently sought, seemingly willing to work wreck to the reputations of defenseless women for the meagre gain of questionable proof to support his preconceived and preannounced decision of Industrial School and magnifies the evidence as zealous- them as being chained to the floor and In the case of the first of these exingly commonplace, for there was not matrons, whose disconnection with deduced a single scintilla of creditable the school dates over six months back, evidence upon which to base a con-Mr. Callaghan with seeming reluc-clusion of extreme wrong-doing. But is the incident did not fail of furnishing conclusive only to the extent that she ground for horror-struck speculation was indiscreet," and while professing as to the opportunities thereby afford-that he "should be loathe to believe ed, and as to what might have octhat her transgressions were of a curred; nor yet of supplying a basis more serious character," does not for suggestive intimations, well dehesitate to so amplify and color his signed for ready assimilation by sus picious and prurient minds, something terrible did occur.

It is somewhat remarkable, considering the eager interest Mr. enter upon a defense of this ex-matron han manifested in the incident above whose conduct as I have said, is not described and in the moral conduct of a matter of concern to this institudescribed and in the moral conduct of he utterly failed to pursue an investigation of the rumors which have been given wide circulation, and with the existence of which he confesses famithis larity, that a number of female inmates of the institution were enceinte. is even more remarkable, in view The other ex-matron, who left here, of the steady trend of his investigadismissed by myself, on February 3, tions and the evident pleasure he deis charged by the Auditor with a "de- rived f rom each Isucious discovery meanor throughout...... great or small, that he actually holds characteristic of the demimonde," and that "for the purposes of the investigreat or small, that he actually holds is thereafter subjected to a series of gation it was considered immaterial reproaches which for vindiciveness, in as to whether or not there were, at the public would understand why, if temporance, crudeness, unmanliness, I the institution, instances existing of have never seen equaled. Forestful such actual condition." Whatever of his own criticism that I "trust too may be the explanation of this sudmuch to the honor of inmates"—not den loss of interest in the logical purrespective degrees of their ver- Auditor failed to place upon the witacity and reliability, whereas he has | ness stand the school physician, who none-Mr. Callaghan does not hesitate more accurately than any other perto hear with avidity and accept with son could give definite and reliable alactricy the testimony of every detestimony on the subject, and thus likely to volunteer as I have suggested, linquent inmate on the racy subject failed to pursue the only course by of this absent and self-defenseless which the ugly rumors of which the woman. I hold no brief for her. I Auditor was at least aware might do not condone her faults or errors, either be established or set at rest. It for which, immediately they became therefore became hecessary-though known to me, the Auditor's unsupported and untruthful statement to the at Mr. Callaghan's investigation—for contrary notwithstanding, she was me to request the attendance of Dr. of their columns to the dissemination dismissed. But there is no visible Agnes McKee Wallace, in order that down this institution—without the justification, and can be no creditable the stain regarded by the Auditor as down this institution—without motive, for the lurid and sensational immaterial, might be removed—in oraccount of her highly colored misdeeds der tha tthere might be one single exin which the Auditor at great length ception to the rule by which the in- false-will prove equally ready indulges. Over sixty pages of trans- vestigation was animated, conducted cript are dedicated to the securing of and bound, of placing stains upon the Dr. Wallace, in the course of her

the slightest degree modified by the crossit examination conducted by Mr. Callatakes on a much lighter tone than the scarlet hue suggested to sensitive eral, definitely and clearly stated that moral minds by the Auditor's in-licate if not boorish language. there was no case of among the inmates of the pregnancy Industrial It is but fair, also, to say that what School, nor have there been during ever of faults and frailties this wo- her incumbency since the 15th of last man had, she wielded a strong and September. She explained that sev-good influence over the girls for a eral girls had declared themselves to considerable time, her chief offense be enceinte, presumably believing that which I was confronted when Govercoming in the latter period of her by such a story they would secure re-employment, when it became appar-moval to another institution from ent to her that she must leave. This which they could more easily escape, Ed- but an examination had demonstrated wards, who teaches the girl's school the falsity of their claims. In tardy and who was in a position to ob- and pitiful rebuttal of this clear and

convincing testimony, which one would rather than think should please chagrin Mr. Callaghan, he asserts in his report that Dr. Wallace's sworn statement "could have been easily offset had I cared to insist upon incorporating in the transcript the testimony of a certain inmate." Thus again is afforded an instance of the Auditor's forgetfulness, while his own mouth he convicts himself of the crime laid at my door—"trusting -the only difference being that he would employ the word of a charge that I was informed and had confined for her serious indiscretions, knowledge of this matron's miscon- and with whose reputation for verduct and ignored the same, or that I acity he is totally unfamiliar, to dis-countenanced any other wrong doing credit the sworn testimony of a reputof which I had reliable information, able woman and physician testifying

-that a marriage of convenience be- establishment of guilt, which evidence tween these two was suggested, pre-sumably by myself, "as a proper pro-davit, establishes beyond peradventure the utter falsity of the rumors main ,but which was not consummated that there are or have been, during H. Kerby ,County Assessor, was sec-because of the objection of Prof. any period with which the present administration is familiar, any instance cratic officials had been registered, of pregnancy among the inmates; and Ed Leonard, Justice of the Peace and all of the insinuations of which Mr. Callaghan—conceding his great ability -is capable, combined to the Machiavillian skill of all the scandal mong-ers and character assassins of all the clacqueing corporation press in Arizona cannot alter the fact.

What Was Found. What other charges are directed at the school and at myself in the report of the Auditor, are of a minor, will show that almost without exception they are of the type which does its work by suggestion intimation and innuendo, rather than by frank, direct, out-spoken declaration, nating the fault, naming the author and fixing the responsibility. I shall not notice them, further than to say that the impression they are intended to create is unjustified and leading, and the condition at the State Industrial School which they are designed to depict does not exist. To new law states ha upon a vacancy reply to them in detail would require existing upon the Board that the two a document of impractical length. Already this reply is much more exhaus-tive than I should prefer, but there have been covered only such matters as seem to absolutely require refutation or explanation; and it should be vacancy. It is held by attorneys how-borne in mind that it is much harder ever that the acts of Supervisors A. borne in mind that it is much harder ever that the acts of Supervisors A. to refute a falsehood or defend a L. Gravely are legal, even though the slander than it is to utter one.

mony produced by Mr. Callaghan's investigation, drawn from his own carefully selected witnesses after two private investigations conducted by himself, and contained in the transcript of evidence in your possession, does not in any essential or material partifort in any essential or material partiform vera Cruz, so that internatinal matters could be restored to their following telegram addressed to those signers of the original appeal whom our Latin-American brethren ought to understand and feel with us that we cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he approach to their former standing, will please us. But our Latin-American brethren ought to understand and feel with us that we cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he approach to their following telegram addressed to those signers of the original appeal whom the country and the provisions of the new law.

Successor to Recorder Kelly.

Immediately after the appointment of Mr. Gravely as a member of the Board, Recorder Kelly will tender his our Latin-American brethren ought to understand and feel with us that we cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he cannot make a pact with Huerta or his associates, or with anyone he cannot make a pact with the succession of the new law. should be glad indeed if some enter- that he will receive the appointment. prising newspaper, with a zeal in behalf of the State Idnustrial School According to the returns made by the similar to that which a number of large mining companies of this counsimilar to that which a tear down and destroy the institution, ing a marked depreciation in the net selected or garbled form, but in full. Then the public might learn, from the Auditor's own record-and not from the statements he makes which purport to be based upon the record- the worst that can be said of the Indus-trial School and its management; then the public would know, if indeed it does not already know that the attack which has extended over a period of many months, and of which Mr. Callaghan's investigation is but the culminating feature, was wholly warranted, unfair and unpatriotic: then the transcript of evidence might be read by every man and woman in Arizona, in conjunction with the Auditor's report, I would be perfectly willing, and I have no doubt the Gov ernor of Arizona-who is the real target of attack-would be perfectly willing, to submit the case without

further comment. Since no enterprising newspaper nor is it likely to be deemed practical in any other way to place Mr. Callaghan's 269 typewritten pages of evidence in the hands of the people of Arizona, I must venture the hope that those newspapers which have shown themselves ever ready to lend the use taking of steps to determine whether their information were to give space to this statement of facts. If they fail or refuse, it will be merely another evidence that they are part and parcel of an organized movement

to conceal the truth and establish falsehood. The Problem I Faced.

I have partially described the diffidustrial School since my accession as Superintendent on the 16th of August. It were well nigh impossible to do the subject justice, or to convey an adequate idea of the nor Hunt said to me: "Mr. Whipple, I give you charge of the Industrial School. Prove to me and to the people of Arizona how kindly, consider-

(Continued on Page 8.)

## FOR FOR ELIMINATION OF KILLING OCCURS FALL ELECTIONS **OPENS** HUERTA

Twenty Names Were Placed on Roll Friday Morning Within An Hour

state election was open. County offi-cials and deputies laid down their are to be demanded at once. tration laws. To Mrs. A. L. Terry, deputy clerk of the Board of Supervisors, belongs the distinction of being the first registered voter. Jas. J. F. Nichols, under sheriff, both republicans, appeared on the scene, and the political returns at the end of the first hour of registration, stood Democrats 18, Republicans 2.

It is understood that each Justice of the Peace throughout the county will be appointed a deputy registering officer by the County Recorder and necessary blanks will be sent through-out the county Registration of voters he temporarily closed pending the holding of the primary election and will be opened again for two weeks prior to the general election. To Re-Appoint Gravely.

Since the arrival of the compiled civil code from the office of the Secretary of State it appears that an error was committed in the appointment of A. L. Gravely as a member of the Board of Supervisors to succeed C. P. Dunn, resigned. The new law states ha upon a vacancy remaining members, together with the County Recorder, shall fill the vacancy. The old law named the Su ior Judge of the County as The old law named the Superthird member to assist in filling the law was not strictly carried out in Finally I wish again to submit and the matter of his appointment. When declare, both in reference to the the Board convenes on Monday Remore serious charges which I have corder Kelly will sit with Members discussed and the lesser ones which Hampton and Campbell and Gravely have not been noticed, that the testi- will be re-appointed according to the

announced decision of guilt or the Recorder in the person of Deputy Rod-"findings" included in his report. I nev Ellis and it is genreally conceded social revolution now going on in I ney Ellis and it is genreally conceded Assessment Lower This Year.

them have exhibited in an effort to ty to the State Tax Commission, showevidence taken at Mr. Callaghan's in-on account of increased expense and vestigation, not in piece-meal, partial, a lower price being received for the on account of increased expense and output as compared with 1912. ment in this county this year will be decreased approximately thirteen million dollars Court house officials estimate that on account of this debe increased to approximately \$1.60 on each \$100.00 valuation.

Marriage License Issued. The Clerk of the Superior Court did rushing business this week in the issuance of marriage neenses.

Jesus Martinez to wed Maria Her-H. B. Weeks to Britida Munguia Enrique de Cruz to Maria J. Ara-

Doreteo Mendez to Josephine Du-Anastacio Madrid to Manuella Ol-

A demurrer and answer has been in the office of the Superior Court in the divorce suit of A. E. Hobbs vs. Dee J. Hobbs, of Duncan, and case will come up for trial at the June term.

The Gila Valley Bank has made ap plication for letters of administration in the estate of Salvatore Chiapelti and Julian L. Barray.

filed letters of administration in the estate of Frank J. Hamlin, deceased.

James R. Dunseath, of Tucson, has

L. Kearney, Esq., has filed letters of administration in the estate of Pablo Bustamente.

Another Treat Comingculties which have attended the man-agement and conduct of the State In-that the management of the Empire and Princess theatres have secured last another treat in the big photo drama production of "Quo Vadis," which will be shown at these houses on evening of May 6th, commencing at the Empire at 7 p. m. and at the Princess at 7:40. The production of Anthony and Cleopatra last Sunday evening was the best pictures ever shown in Clifton and both theatres were packed to the doors. "Quo his patriotism and his love for the Vadis" is still a better production.

## GARRANZA AND

EL PASO, TEAXAS, May 1, 1914. — Reported that A. B. C. Alliance will There was a rush for the often of erned by commission of five men the County Recorder of Friday morning bigs 1st, when Deputy Recorder tions under supervision of representatives of the three great South Americand and allow country to be governed by the supervision of five men the Country Recorder of the South Americand and allow country to be governed by the supervision of the supervision of representatives of the three great South Americand corders office and proclaimed that can Republics—private advices received Registration for the 1914 county and ed in El Paso to the effect that resignation their are to be demanded at once.

"The constitutionalists cannot enter into an armistice or even a pact which involves a cessation of hostili-ties between themselves and Huerta, but must continue using their best military efforts to overthrow him and establish a form of domestic government," said Roberto V. Pesquiera, diplomatic agent of the constitutionalists, last night. Mr. Pesquiera was discussing the proposal of the A. B. C. alliance that General Carranza and the constitutionalists join in the armistice agreed to by Huerta and the United States while the differences between this country and the Mexican dictator are being mediated.

Mediation Proposed a Good Thing.

"Of course any official statement on this important subject must come from our first chief, General Carranza. But, speaking solely for my-self, and in an unofficial manner, I will state in the first place that the matter has not yet reached the stage of 'mediating' as the invitations so far are merely in the form of a pro-posal of 'good offices,' looking toward the bringing about of mediation," said Mr. Pesqueira. "Consequently, I believe the proposal a good thing, no matter what the final result, as it delays matters and gives all parties concerned time for calm reflection. That Huerta accepts the good offices is an indication of his desperate situation, and due in large measure no doubt to the pressure of European representatives, and the recent victories of the constitutionalist forces in

No Agreement With Huerta.

"Latin America, or at least Central and South America, are vitally interested in the solution of the apparent conflict between the United States and Huerta, and of course, any plan of mediation at which the liance may arrive which will bring about reparation on the part of ing been pupils and nearly all graduates of the military academy at social revolution now going Mexico must achieve a signal victory in the overthrow of Huerta and his co-partners in crime by force of arms.

"Any other solution at this time i would leave the great problems of would publish the transcript of the output in this district for the year 1913 our country unsolved and it would not bring a permanent peace.

Commission Government Proposed Mr. Pesquiera also said that he had been privately advised by constitutionalist agents in Washington that the plan of the A. B. C. alliance would probably be to request the resignations of both Huerta and Carranza, and, until elections could be held, that Mexico be ruled by a commission of five men to be chosen by the alliance.

"We are informed further," said Mr. Pesquiera, "that in all probabil-ties an absolute eccessation of hostilities on the part of both federals and constitutionalists would be requested and that, pending the election and installation of the president elected the affairs of Mexico would be administered by the commission already referred to. This commission together with the representatives of Argentine, Brazil and Chile, and possibly of the United States and Mexico, would conduct the election, act as judges and reserve to themselves the right to call another election if doubt has not yet officially been put before us and may not be, but in the opinion of our agents in Washington it will probably be the plan proposed.

"I have no idea what General Car ranza's views are regarding the propo-

Attempt to Change Angeles' Views According to advices received by the constitutionalist bureau of information, Gen. Felipe Angeles, subsecretary of war in the Carranza cabinet and chief of the artillery division of General Villa's constitutionalist army, received a long dispatch yesdated at Saltillo, urging him to rejoin the federal army, in order defend "the patriotism and honor of Mexico against the 'spectre of the north.' The telegram was signed by Generals Francisco Romero, Joaquin Maas, Garcia Hidalgo, A. Caso Lopez, Javier de Moure, Manuel Corral, Monasterio, Hernando Leon, and Jacinto Guerra and other officers of lesser rank.

It went on to say that Mexico was alma mater-all of those signing hav-

C. C. Paddock, an Aged Ranc Shoots and Instantly Kills Smith, as Result of Altercation garding Ownership of

Word reached Sheriff Patt Saturday morning, May 2, tellin a killing which occurred at a ranch about five miles north

The assailant was C. C. Paddo aged sixty, and an old resident of the section. The man killed was . Smith, an employee and part ow of a herd of goats, regarding the ow ship of which, a quarrel had enson more than one occasion, and wh culminated in the killing of Smith Paddock Saturday morning, May 2,

8:00 o'clock. The first word of the killing re ed Metcalf officers from the lips Paddock himself, who walked Metcalf shortly after nine o'clock a stated to Constable Geo. By Smith at his ranch that morning had come to give up. Paddock ded that the shooting was done in defense. Burkner accompanied Pa dock to the room of Deputy Sher Holland Bass where he was held Saturday pending an investigation Coroner Burns.

It is claimed there were three winesses to the tragedy, two Mexico herders and Mike Leahy, well know in this section, who was tempora

A story told by one of the witnesses who arrived in Metcalf from the rance after Paddock gave himself up is the effect that Smith entered the gos corral about eight o'clock Saturda morning and began cutting out bunch of goats from the herd. Pace dock appeared and demanded of Pace and Cock appeared and demanded of Pace 1999. dock appeared and demanded of Sn whose goats he was cutting out Smith replied that he was taking only the goats which belonged to him whereupon Paddock, covered him with his rifle, and saying "Like h-ll, you are, you——," fired, droppins are, you—," Smith to the ground.

Mike Leahy who went to the faller man informed Paddock that he has killed Smith and Paddock immediately left for Metcalf. As the Era goes to press the full proceedings of the coroner's inquest have received.

sorrow that I find your names ar the officers, including many generals. who are being swept along by the wind of treason to their own destruc-tion and the undoing of the republic appealing to me to desert my colors. know you all well and have some comprehension of the reasons for your adherence to the Huertista I greatly regret your em Your telegram says barrassment. that we are on the eve of a race war. This is false; we are however in great danger of being drawn into a terrible war which is being delib ately provoked by Huerta in that he may stop the great triumph which will soon be ours-we of democratic party of Mexico. In case this conflict between the two races is brought about it will be the second in which the national army of Mexico has participated. you are patriots you could with but two words bring peace to Mexico You could say to Huerta: Stop here. However, I do not expect under the circumstances, that you will give utterance to those words. I depend only upon the greatness of President Woodrow Wilson, the good sense of the great American people, and in the true patriotism of the directors the of the democratic party of Mexico to stop Huerta and bring peace to our unhappy country. If all else fails we may perhaps die, each going his own is expressed in any quarter as to the way. I cannot prevail upon myself fairness of the first. This proposition to join with the defenders of two to join with the defenders of two such great crimes as you, the adherents of Huerta, are guilty of "FELIPE ANGELES.

> Doesn't Appeal to Musquiz.
> "The constitutionalists will never agree to an armistice with the Huer-ta forces," Constitutionalist Consul Rafael E. Musquiz said yesterday. With the federal forces at Saltille demoralized as they are at present. it would be impossible for us to agree to an armistice, as the federals are more to violate it by replenishing their ammunition and other supplies and by sending in reinforcements.

> The proposition of an ment for an armistice between Huerand General Carranza was telegraphed yesterday through El Paso by the "A. B. C." alliance to General Carranza at Chihuahua, but so far as known here, Carranza has made no reply to it. Constitutionlists here say that when he does reply it will probably be to reject the proposition.

R. J. Coleman, deputy assessor, this week began the work of making up the original tax roll of this county for the year 1914.